Violence Against Indigenous Women in the United States, including the Crisis of Missing or Murdered Indigenous Women, and Lack of Safe and Adequate Housing for Indigenous Survivors

United States' Noncompliance with Obligations under the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination

An Alternative Report
Submitted to the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, 107th Session (08-30 August 2022)

By
The Alaska Native Women’s Resource Center,
The Indian Law Resource Center,
The National Indigenous Women’s Resource Center
with its project STTARS Indigenous Safe Housing Center, and
the Pouhana ‘O Nā Wahine

15 July 2022
# Table of Contents

I. Reporting Organizations .................................................. Page 3

II. Executive Summary ........................................................ Page 3

III. Issue Summary ............................................................... Page 4

   A. Violence Against Indigenous Women ............................... Page 4

      (1) The Crisis of Missing or Murdered Indigenous Women  Page 6

   B. Lack of Safe and Adequate Housing for Indigenous Survivors Page 7

IV. Legal Framework – CERD’s Concluding Observations .......... Page 8

   A. Violence Against Indigenous Women,
      including the Crisis of Missing or Murdered Indigenous Women Page 8

   B. Lack of Safe and Adequate Housing for Indigenous Survivors Page 9

V. U.S. Response ................................................................. Page 9

   A. Violence Against Indigenous Women,
      including the Crisis of Missing or Murdered Indigenous Women Page 9

   B. Lack of Safe and Adequate Housing for Indigenous Survivors Page 9

VI. Recommended Questions to the U.S. ................................. Page 10

VII. Suggested Recommendations .......................................... Page 11
I. Reporting Organizations

This issue-oriented alternative report is submitted jointly to the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination (Committee) by the following nongovernmental organizations: the Alaska Native Women’s Resource Center, the Indian Law Resource Center, an NGO in special consultative status with ECOSOC, the National Indigenous Women’s Resource Center with its project STTARS Indigenous Safe Housing Center, and the Pouhana ‘O Nā Wahine.

II. Executive Summary

We welcome the report of the United States government. This alternative report spotlights how the United States' continuing violations of the International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination (ICERD) through its discriminatory legal

---

1 Organized in 2015, the Alaska Native Women’s Resource Center (AKNWRC) is a tribal nonprofit organization dedicated to ending violence against women with Alaska’s 229 tribes and allied organizations. AKNWRC board members are Alaska Native women raised in Alaska Native Villages and have 141 years of combined experience in tribal governments, nonprofit management, domestic violence and sexual assault advocacy (both individual crisis and systems and grassroots social change advocacy at the local, statewide, regional, national and international levels), and other social service experience. AKNWRC’s philosophy is that violence against women is rooted in the colonization of indigenous nations. (www.aknwrc.org)

2 Founded in 1978 by American Indians, the Indian Law Resource Center (ILRC) is a nonprofit organization that provides legal assistance to indigenous peoples of the Americas to combat racism and oppression, to protect their lands and environment, to protect their cultures, to achieve sustainable economic development and genuine self-government and to realize their other human rights. Its Safe Women, Strong Nation’s project works with indigenous women’s organizations and Native nations to end violence against indigenous women. ILRC is in consultative status with the UN Economic and Social Council. (www.indianlaw.org)

3 The National Indigenous Women’s Resource Center, Inc. (NIWRC) is a Native-led nonprofit organization dedicated to ending violence against Native women and children. The NIWRC provides national leadership in ending gender-based violence in tribal communities by lifting up the collective voices of grassroots advocates and offering culturally grounded resources, technical assistance and training, and policy development to strengthen tribal sovereignty. Staff of the NIWRC bring decades of expertise in building the grassroots movement to increase tribal responses to domestic violence and increase safety for Native women. In 2015, the NIWRC launched the Violence Against Women Act (VAWA) Sovereignty Initiative to defend the constitutionality and functionality of all VAWA tribal provisions. In 2022, the NIWRC announced its latest project STTARS Indigenous Safe Housing Center, which works to ensure safety and belonging through indigenous lifeways and to dismantle systemic and endemic barriers that impact housing access for survivors of gender-based violence. (www.niwrc.org)

4 The Pouhana ‘O Nā Wahine (Pillars of Women - PONW) is a grassroots organization focused on opening a Native Hawaiian Resource Center on Domestic Violence to reduce disparities faced by Native Hawaiians. These disparities date back to the days of contact with foreigners resulting in the overthrow of our monarch to present day violence and injustice. Our vision is to restore balance of mind, body, and spirit, bringing our people to the state of well-being; and to preserve and promote Hawaiian culture to help families and communities heal from domestic and sexual violence and colonization. Our mission is to advocate for Native Hawaiian families who face challenges related to domestic and gender-based violence by exercising our inherent sovereign rights as Indigenous people of Hawaii to care for and protect our people. Collectively, the individuals of PONW have over 50 years of experience in the advocacy and social service field and are all Kanaka Oiwi who have a passion for helping to heal generations past and present to ensure the healthiest future.
system perpetuates violence, discrimination, and injustices against American Indian, Alaska Native, and Native Hawaiian women, including the crisis of missing or murdered indigenous women, and the lack of safe, sanitary, and adequate housing, a human right, for indigenous women survivors of gender-based violence. The United States is failing to uphold its obligations to protect indigenous women under ICERD Articles 2 (obligation to eliminate racial discrimination in all its forms); 5 (right to security of the person and protection against violence, and right to housing); and 6 (effective protection and remedies against racial discrimination).

III. Issue Summary

A. Violence Against Indigenous Women

Violence against American Indian, Alaska Native, and Native Hawaiian women is at unprecedented levels in the United States, and it is one of the most egregious manifestations of the discriminatory legal system in the country. Significant areas of federal law, policy, and practices fail to meet the United States’ obligations under the ICERD, particularly Articles 2, 5, and 6, and other human rights instruments with respect to protection of indigenous women from violence and ensuring nondiscrimination and equality under federal law. Both the UN and American Declarations on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples affirm the rights of indigenous women to enjoy protection against all forms of violence and discrimination.5 Even its own domestic law explicitly acknowledges the United States has a federal trust responsibility to assist tribes in safeguarding the lives of Indian women.6

Up-to-date disaggregated data and statistics concerning the gender-based violence experienced by indigenous women and girls in the United States is lacking. We commend the United States for noting in its report that the National Institute of Justice has launched a National Baseline Study of crime and victimization in Indian country and Alaska Native villages.

In the meantime, however, the Violence Against Women 2022 Reauthorization Act (VAWA 2022), enacted by the United States on March 5, 2022, offers a disturbing picture of violence against indigenous women in the United States explicitly finding that:7

- More than 4 in 5 American Indian and Alaska Native women have experienced violence in their lifetimes.
- American Indian and Alaska Native women are 2.5 times more likely to be sexually assaulted or raped than other women in the United States.

---

5 UN Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, Article 22, and American Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples, Article 7.
6 See, e.g., Consolidated Appropriations Act, 2022, Pub. Law No. 117-103 (3/15/2022), containing the Violence Against Women Act 2022 Reauthorization, § 811(a)(4) of Subtitle B.
• The vast majority of American Indian and Alaska Native victims of this violence — 96% of women victims have experienced sexual violence by a non-Indian perpetrator at least once.  

• Their murder rate is ten times the national average on some reservations.

• The Centers for Disease Control and Prevention notes that homicide is the third leading cause of death among American Indian and Alaska Native women between 10 and 24 years of age, and the fifth leading cause of death for American Indian and Alaska Native women between 25 and 34 years of age.

• 64% of human trafficking victims in the State of Hawai‘i identify as being at least part Hawaiian.

• In Alaska, where at least 75 indigenous communities lack any law enforcement presence at all, Alaska Native women suffer the highest rates of domestic and sexual violence as compared to populations of other Indian tribes; are “overrepresented in the domestic victim population by 250 percent;” and although comprising just 19% of the population in Alaska, comprise 47% of reported rape victims in Alaska.

• A 2017 report by the Department of Justice states that in 66% of the criminal cases in Indian country that U.S. Attorneys declined to prosecute, the cases involved assault, murder, or sexual assault.  

In sum, these recent 2022 legislative findings reflect clearly that there has been little if any improvement in restoring safety to American Indian and Alaska Native women since the Committee issued its 2014 Concluding Observations to the United States. Rates of violence against American Indian, Alaska Native, and Native Hawaiian women remain disproportionately higher than the violence experienced by others in the United States. There is a lack of law enforcement, especially in Alaska. Federal officials who do have jurisdiction to investigate and prosecute cases of assault, murder, or sexual assault against Indian women are continuing to decline to do so at alarming rates. The impacts of COVID-19 and climate change on indigenous communities seem to be making a bad situation even worse. StrongHearts Native Helpline is a national domestic, dating, and sexual violence helpline, culturally specific for Native people. Where the National Domestic Violence Hotline has more than 4,000 resources in its database, StrongHearts Native Helpline has fewer than 300 Native resources. There are more than 1,500 shelters across the country compared to fewer than 60 Native shelters.

Finally, under United States law, tribes still lack full criminal authority over non-Indians committing crimes on tribal lands or in Alaska Native villages. Despite the historic restoration of tribal jurisdiction over certain non-Indians committing domestic violence, dating violence, or violations of protection orders in the federal Violence Against Women Reauthorization Act (“VAWA”) of 2013, to date, only about 27 out of the 574 federally recognized tribal governments exercise this very limited Special Domestic Violence Jurisdiction. These tribes have reported significant success holding violent offenders accountable for crimes of domestic violence, dating

---

8 Notably, tribal governments lack full criminal authority over non-Indian perpetrators of violence against indigenous women.

9 A 2019 report by the Department of Justice stated that the majority of Indian country declinations (60.7%) related to physical assaults and sexual assaults or exploitation, or failure to register as a sex offender. Another 7.2% of Indian country declinations in 2019 involved murder. U.S. Department of Justice Indian Country Investigations and Prosecutions Report, available at https://www.justice.gov/otj/page/file/1405001/download at pg. 33.
violence, and civil protection order violations. However, significant barriers and dangerous gaps have remained due to the very, very limited jurisdiction restored to tribes. For example, under this 2013 law, strangers could still enter reservations or Alaska Native lands and commit violent crimes against Indian and Alaska Native women with impunity. Furthermore, VAWA 2013 left Alaska Native women almost completely behind, prohibiting 228 of the 229 Alaska Native Villages from exercising the laws’ special domestic violence criminal jurisdiction based solely on the way their lands are classified.

Despite its inadequacies, VAWA 2013 was a crucial law and when the United States allowed it to lapse in 2018, American Indian and Alaska Native women were deeply concerned. After years of inaction, the United States finally updated and reauthorized the law in March 2022. The Tribal Title of VAWA 2022, set forth in Title VIII, includes Subtitle A, Safety for Indian Women, as a federal response to the legal gaps and barriers remaining in VAWA. Subtitle A responds to the epidemic of violence in Indian and Alaska Native communities by reaffirming and restoring Special Tribal Criminal Jurisdiction to participating tribes over non-Indian offenders that commit not just crimes of domestic and dating violence and violations of protection orders, but six additional crimes (Covered Crimes) that occur in the Indian country of the participating tribe. Covered Crimes will include all of the following: (A) assault of Tribal justice personnel; (B) child violence; (C) dating violence; (D) domestic violence; (E) obstruction of justice; (F) sexual violence; (G) sex trafficking; (H) stalking; and (I) violations of protections orders. The provisions take effect in October 2022.

VAWA 2022 also is intended to restore safety for Alaska Native women by reaffirming the inherent authority of Alaska tribes over all Indian persons in a village and creating an Alaska pilot program allowing up to 30 Alaska tribes to exercise Special Tribal Criminal Jurisdiction over Covered Crimes committed by non-Indians (unless both the alleged victim and alleged defendant are non-Indians) within a village. The Special Tribal Criminal Jurisdiction of an Alaska tribe is concurrent with any jurisdiction possessed by the State of Alaska or the United States. A major concern will be whether sufficient and equitable resources will be provided to fund and support not only the justice systems of the Alaska tribes participating in the pilot program, but also to build needed infrastructure.

(1) The Crisis of Missing or Murdered Indigenous Women

The crisis of missing and murdered indigenous women and girls plagues indigenous communities throughout the United States, including indigenous women attempting to cross our southern borders. It seems that few Native families escape the unspeakable heartbreak of having a beloved mother, daughter, wife, or auntie, if not multiple women in a family, go missing or be found murdered.

10 See https://www.ncai.org/resources/ncai-publications/SDVCJ_5_Year_Report.pdf.
11 VAWA 2022, Subtitle B, Alaska Tribal Public Safety Empowerment, of Title VIII.
The federal response to these cases has been untimely and inadequate, including a lack of accountability at the state and local level.13 Sadly, it is often the family and friends of the missing that must conduct the search, investigate the case, and, tragically, find their deceased relative. Although certain missing person cases attract intense news coverage, far too often the media is disinterested and of limited help where indigenous women and girls are missing, a phenomenon termed the “missing white woman syndrome.”

Shockingly, no one can even tell you how many indigenous women in the United States are missing or may have been murdered.

In November 2021, the U.S. Government Accountability Office (GAO) published a report on missing or murdered indigenous women acknowledging that “the total number of missing or murdered indigenous women is unknown,” citing the lack of more comprehensive case data in the federal databases.14 The GAO pointed out two 2020 laws—the Not Invisible Act and Savannah’s Act—that might help address some of the crisis if the Departments of Justice and Interior were to implement them adequately. Disappointingly, the GAO went on to note that the agencies have missed critical requirements’ deadlines in these two laws, including but not limited to failing to set up a joint commission under the Not Invisible Act to explore the issue by February 7, 2021. The Secretary of the Interior, in coordination with the Attorney General, eventually appointed the joint commission on May 5, 2022, more than a year beyond the statutory deadline. The GAO recommended that both departments develop plans to meet other unfulfilled requirements under the two laws in order to offer more assurance that the departments would meet their legal obligations. Additionally, the GAO recommended that the Department of Justice develop a plan for accomplishing ongoing analyses of missing or murdered American Indian and Alaska Native women data to identify trends and areas of concern.

B. Lack of Safe and Adequate Housing for Indigenous Survivors

Across the United States, American Indian and Alaska Native women are often forced to flee their houses and homelands to escape violence, due to federal laws and policies that protect them less and leave them more vulnerable than other women. Nationally, domestic violence and sexual assault are the leading causes of homelessness in most communities within the United States. In Alaska Native and American Indian communities where women experience domestic violence and sexual assault at extreme and disproportionate levels, this problem is aggravated by problems related to access to land, the lack of sufficient funding for federally recognized tribes to support culturally grounded safe housing and shelter, disproportionate governmental separation and removals of Indian children, and inadequate law enforcement, medical services, or intervention programs for abusive partners. All of these factors are the result of discriminatory policies rooted in colonialism and anti-indigenous prejudice.15

15 For a detailed discussion on the need for safe housing for indigenous women, see “National Workgroup on Safe Housing for American Indian and Alaska Native Survivors of Gender-Based Violence: Lessons Learned”, Carolyn
Safe housing and shelter are integral to women’s safety, yet women also need access to a full range of supportive services as they begin their healing journey after experiencing violence. Currently, there are only 55 Native-centered domestic violence shelters for 574 Indian tribes in the United States. The low number of Native shelters is largely the result of the lack of adequate direct federal funding, and the lack of federal support for tribal infrastructure, including staff and technical assistance needed to create and operate a shelter.

For Alaska Native Villages and American Indian tribes, safe housing and shelter needs are unique, varying by tribe, geography, and each individual Native woman’s healing journey and needs. The federal Family Violence Prevention and Services Act (FVPSA), provides flexible funding to address the needs of women and their children. Funding under this law has been the anchor for tribal shelter programs for decades. Since 2013, tribes and grassroots advocates have pushed for key amendments to increase FVPSA funding for tribal shelter services so that more indigenous women are able to access culturally appropriate shelter services in their communities. To date, the United States Congress has ignored these pleas, leaving indigenous women unnecessarily at risk.

IV. Legal Framework – CERD’s Concluding Observations

A. Violence Against Indigenous Women, including the Crisis of Missing or Murdered Indigenous Women

In 2014, the Committee reiterated in its Concluding Observations on the United States’ combined reports that ICERD requires State parties “to prohibit and eliminate racial discrimination in all its forms, including practices and legislation that may not be discriminatory in purpose, but are discriminatory in effect.”16

Additionally, the Committee remained “concerned at the disproportionate number of women . . . particularly American Indian and Alaska Native women, who continue to be subjected to violence, including rape and sexual violence.”17 Acknowledging the increased sentencing authority of tribes under the Tribal Law and Order Act of 2010 and expanded jurisdiction of tribes over certain domestic violence and protective orders under the Violence Against Women Reauthorization Act of 2013, the Committee remained concerned that tribes’ jurisdiction is limited, and “indigenous women are denied the right to access to justice and to obtain adequate reparation or satisfaction for damages suffered.”18

In 2014, the Committee called on the United States to:


16 Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, Concluding observations on the seventh to ninth periodic reports of the United States of America, adopted August 2014, CERD/C/USA/CO/7-9 (hereinafter 2014 Concluding Observations), at ¶ 5.

17 Concluding Observations, at ¶ 19.

18 Concluding Observations, at ¶ 19 (citing arts. 5 and 6).
[I]ntensify its efforts to prevent and combat violence against women, particularly American Indian and Alaska Native women, and ensure that all cases of violence against women are effectively investigated, perpetrators are prosecuted and sanctioned, and victims are provided with appropriate remedies. It also urges the State party to take measure to guarantee, in law and in practice, the right to access justice and effective remedies for all indigenous women who are victims of violence. It also reiterates its previous recommendation that the State party provide sufficient resources for violence prevention and service programmes; provide specific training for those working with the criminal justice system, including police officers, lawyers, prosecutors, judges, and medical personnel; and undertake awareness-raising campaigns on the mechanisms and procedures available to seek remedies for violence against women.19

B. Lack of Safe and Adequate Housing for Indigenous Survivors

In its 2014 Concluding Observations, the Committee called on the United States to “[e]nsure close cooperation among all relevant stakeholders . . . to intensify efforts to find solutions for the homeless, in accordance with human rights standards.”20

While recognizing the positive steps taken by the United States to address discrimination in housing access, the Committee, in its 2014 Concluding Observations, urges the United States “to strengthen its efforts to eliminate discrimination in access to housing” by, among other things, “[e]nsuring the availability of affordable and adequate housing for all . . .”21

V. U.S. Response

A. Violence Against Indigenous Women, including the Crisis of Missing or Murdered Indigenous Women

In its Combined Periodic Reports,22 the United States reports in ¶ 101 that it “is concerned about violence against women and takes aggressive action to prosecute perpetrators and provide services to victims.”

In ¶¶ 102-110 of its Combined Periodic Reports,23 the United States identifies a number of programs and grants to support tribes and combat violence against indigenous women. The United States discusses in ¶ 110 the Presidential Task Force on Missing and Murdered American Indians and Alaska Natives established in 2019 by Executive Order.

19 Concluding Observations, at ¶ 19.
20 Concluding Observations, at ¶ 12.
21 Concluding Observations, at ¶ 13.
22 Combined tenth to twelfth periodic reports submitted by the United States of America to the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, received 2 June 2021, CERD/C/USA/10-12 (20 December 2021).
23 Combined tenth to twelfth periodic reports submitted by the United States of America to the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, received 2 June 2021, CERD/C/USA/10-12 (20 December 2021).
In ¶ 112 of its Combined Periodic Reports, the United States reports on the Trilateral Working Group on Violence against Indigenous Women and Girls involving the United States, Canada and Mexico, noting that in 2018, the Working Group consulted with indigenous women to share lessons learned and best practices.

B. Lack of Safe and Adequate Housing for Indigenous Survivors

The United States reports in ¶ 108 of its Combined Periodic Reports that in 2016 funding of $9.2 million dollars was made available by the Department of Justice and HUD for stable housing to victims of domestic violence, dating violence, sexual assault, and stalking who are living with HIV/AIDS. The United States further reports in ¶ 111 that the Department of Housing and Urban Development (HUD) published a final rule in 2016 implementing the requirements of VAWA 2013, which expanded VAWA housing protections to HUD programs and issued guidance regarding local nuisance ordinances that may lead to discrimination against survivors of domestic violence and other persons in need of emergency services.

VI. Recommended Questions to the U.S.

1. In its periodic report at ¶ 109, the United States offers three examples of its aggressive investigation and prosecution of violence against Native women, all of which involved Native perpetrators. Considering that current federal statistics indicate that the vast majority of these crimes are committed by non-Indians over whom tribes lack full criminal authority, can the United States say how many non-Indians are being prosecuted for violence against Native women?

2. What will the United States do differently in 2022 than it did in 2013 to intensify and better assist with implementation of the expanded special tribal jurisdiction provisions of VAWA and with the pilot program for Alaska tribes?

3. The United States has obligations under international and its own domestic laws to safeguard indigenous women and girls from violence on and off tribal lands and in Alaska Native villages. What are some of the best practices the United States is using to restore safety to indigenous women present on the more than 56 million acres of land held in trust by the federal government for the benefit of American Indian and Alaska Native communities and with respect to those tribes whose lands are located along international borders with Canada and Mexico making indigenous women particularly vulnerable to trafficking and violence?

4. The majority of cases that are being declined in Indian country by the Department of Justice involve sexual assault, sexual violence, or murder. These are cases that cry out for

---

24 Combined tenth to twelfth periodic reports submitted by the United States of America to the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, received 2 June 2021, CERD/C/USA/10-12 (20 December 2021).
25 Combined tenth to twelfth periodic reports submitted by the United States of America to the Committee on the Elimination of Racial Discrimination, received 2 June 2021, CERD/C/USA/10-12 (20 December 2021).
26 Visit Trust Land Acquisition, at Trust Land Acquisition (Fee to Trust) | Indian Affairs (bia.gov).
prosecution in order to stop perpetrators from continuing to act with impunity. What steps are being taken by the Department to hold more perpetrators of these crimes accountable in order to provide indigenous women survivors justice and to restore safety to them?

5. With only some 55 shelters dedicated to serving 574 federally recognized Indian tribes, what steps is the United States taking to expand access to safe and adequate housing for indigenous victims of domestic violence and sexual assault?

VII. Suggested Recommendations

We respectfully request that the Committee consider the following recommendations in drafting its Concluding Observations following the United States’ periodic review session:

1. Improve United States law to: (a) remove systemic discriminatory barriers, whether in law, policy, or practices, that fail to protect Indian and Alaska Native women against violence; (b) ensure that Alaska’s 229 tribes can enjoy the increased protections that apply to other federally recognized tribes; and (c) empower Indian and Alaska Native nations to ensure safety and justice in their communities through the restoration and exercise of their inherent sovereign power to exercise full criminal jurisdiction over all people within their lands.

2. Provide consistent, non-competitive base funding and technical assistance, relevant to the area of concern, to Indian and Alaska Native nations, including their law enforcement, judicial, and criminal justice systems, in sufficient, equitable amounts and by appropriate means to ensure equal protection and meaningful justice for all American Indian and Alaska Native victims of domestic and sexual violence.

3. Provide consistent, non-competitive base funding and technical assistance, relevant to the area of concern, to Indian and Alaska Native nations to support the development and operation of culturally appropriate, safe and adequate housing, including shelters for victims of domestic violence and sexual assault.

4. Provide funding for a Native Hawaiian Resource Center on Domestic Violence to develop culturally relevant training and technical assistance, monitor policies, and engage with systems to address violence against Native Hawaiian women.

5. Fully and effectively implement the Tribal Law and Order Act of 2010, and recommendations of the independent, bipartisan Indian Law and Order Commission, as set forth in its report, mandated by the Tribal Law and Order Act, to the President and Congress of the United States, submitted in November 2013.27

27 A Roadmap for Making Native America Safer, at http://www.aisc.ucla.edu/iloc/report/. The report is considered to be the most comprehensive study and assessment of the criminal justice systems serving American Indian and Alaska Native communities.
6. Ratify the Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women and, in considering this action, engage in meaningful consultation with Indian and Alaska Native nations and Native Hawaiian organizations that may be impacted by such an action.